

Moray College UHI
Review of Board Effectiveness
March 2021

by



Substantial Assurance

Section 5 Findings

5.1 Compliance with the Code of Good Governance

5.1.1 Leadership & Strategy

The College has its '*Code of Conduct*' for Board Members which outlines what is expected from them on a personal and professional basis. The Code is based around the *9 Principles of Public Life*. From the Board of Management papers reviewed and from discussions held & witnessed, it is clear that these principles form the framework for decision making and underlying conduct of the Board of Management. While the '*Code of Conduct*' is detailed and robust, the published version on the College's website states that this was due for review in August 2020 and no review has yet taken place. Please see **Recommendation 1** for further information.

There is a clear vision, mission and values for the College. This is evidenced in their Strategic and Operational plans as well as in the conduct of the Board Members. The College's Strategic Plan covers the period 2016/21, the Board of Management in agreement with the Principal took the decision to delay the development of the new Strategic Plan to allow the College to fully assess the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic and the effect that this will have on the College moving forward. Our discussions with Board Members and the Principal found that the development of the new Strategic Plan will begin with the Board Development Day scheduled to be held in Summer 2021. This will also allow the College to sync their Strategic Plan with that of the UHI Plan.

As a College within the University of the Highlands and Islands (UHI), there is limited scope for the College's 'area' stakeholders to be engaged in compiling the area *Outcome Agreement* as this is balanced at a central level by the Regional Strategic Committee at UHI, the Board of Management look to provide feedback on the *Outcome Agreement* as and when required.

The College has a suite of Key Performance Indicator's (KPIs), which are used to inform the decision-making processes. The KPIs are monitored by the Senior Leadership Team monthly and the reporting of the KPIs forms part of the Principal's report presented to each Board of Management meeting.

Our review of Board of Management papers, our attendance at the Board of Management meeting on 15th December 2020 and our meetings with Board Members highlighted that the Committee system was working well and it allowed time to review items in detail at each Committee. During our meetings with Board Members and the Clerk, it was highlighted that Board Members and the Clerk would like the Board papers to be issued earlier and in line with best practice of 1 week prior to the meeting. We discussed this with the Clerk who provided us with a schedule of meeting dates for 2020 for all Board of Management meetings and the Committees and we found papers were not issued 1 week prior to the meeting for any

meeting held in 2020. It was noted that during our meeting with the Chairs of the Committees that they have requested that the Agenda and available papers for the meetings are sent out 5 working days (1 week) prior to the meeting and any late papers issued as and when received. We have witnessed papers for the Board of Management, or its Committees being received on the day of the meeting. Please see **Recommendation 2** for further information.

5.1.2 Quality of the Student Experience

The College does not have its own stand-alone Student's Association and the College's Student Association is the Highlands & Islands Student Association (HISA). HISA's Constitution and Memorandum and Articles of Association were implemented in October 2015. We also note that HISA is resourced by UHI according to its requirements. The College has 2 HISA Deputies who sit on the Board and its Committees except for the Staff Governance Committee.

While overall attendance of the Student Members does not appear to be an issue from reviewing the Board of Management and Committee papers, there was no Student Member in attendance at the 15th December 2020 Board of Management meeting that we attended. However, the Students Association was represented by a staff member from HISA. During our review and discussions with both Board Members and the Student Members we found that there is some frustration from both parties, and this was also evident from our attendance at the Board of Management meeting held on the 15th December 2020. Please see **recommendation 3** for further information.

Board Members highlighted that they believed the Student Members did not participate or actively engage in the meetings or that they fully understood their role as members of the Board of Management. Board Members also highlighted their frustration at information requested from HISA and highlighted that Student Members have access to the information and attended Board of Management meetings when this was discussed. We discussed this with the Student Members who highlighted that the HISA requests come from HISA and not them specifically and are a HISA wide request for all Colleges within UHI. Please see **recommendation 3** for further information.

Both Student Members highlighted that they did not have a full understanding of what their role as Board Members is and that there is no clear roles or responsibilities for their role. We do note that our review of training events offered to Board Members found that both Student Members were offered the same events as other Board Members. Both Student Members noted that when they were running for election as a HISA Depute, they did not fully appreciate that this would also entail being full Board Members at Moray College UHI. Please see **recommendation 3** for further information. Both Student and Board Members also highlighted that attendance and preparation for meetings would sometimes consume their 14 hours working allowance with HISA and this impacted their ability to complete their tasks

along with study. Our discussions with the Student Members also found that they lack confidence in speaking up during meetings and that this was enhanced due to the remote meetings. Both Student Members also highlighted that they believed a strong succession plan for new Student Members would be beneficial. Please see recommendation 5 for further information.

The Board of Management received an annual report from HISA and an update from HISA is a standing agenda item at each Board of Management meeting.

At the 15th December 2020 Board of Management meeting, the Board discussed additional help for the Student Members with the HISA Deputes in attendance and it was agreed that the HISA Deputes would help the Student Members prepare for the Board of Management and Committee meetings going forward.

The College has a class representative system in place where the class representative brings forward the views and feedback of their class to help enhance student experience at the College. Monthly meetings are run by HISA and are attended by Senior Management and/or Board Members within the College.

From our review, we found that the curriculum offered by the College seems to meet the demands of students, local employers and stakeholders. The College seems to be well engaged with its community and has taken steps to ensure its curriculum is fit for purpose and sits well within the framework to address local, regional and national priorities.

Ensuring the quality of the student experience, despite resources being tight, does seem to be at the core of what the College is doing.

5.1.3 Accountability

Reading the Board of Management and Committee papers along with speaking with Board Members, the College does what it can to influence the shape of the Regional Outcome Agreement with the Regional Strategic Committee. The Chair and Vice Chair of the Board attend regular meetings with UHI.

Looking at the information on performance against target provided to the Board of Management on 15th December 2020, it highlights that the College are on target to meet the HE funded target while for the FE Credit target, the College's target for the year is higher than it has ever been due to an additional credits of 2,000 awarded to the UHI region which resulted in the credits being apportioned to UHI members. The College note that it will be a challenge to achieve these targets. However, due to the Covid-19 pandemic, the SFC has stated they do not intend to claw back funding where under recruitment is related to the Covid-19 pandemic. The College was required to provide a 3-year Financial Forecast Return

(FFR) to the SFC at the end of June 2020 and the College were advised that whilst there could be a budget deficit for 2020/21, there would have to be sufficient savings to provide a balanced budget that was within ministerial guidance of £450k deficit. The College developed a detailed FFR based on known income and costs which projected a phased recovery of lost income and cost savings over the next 3 years. A Special Board meeting was held in September 2020 that highlighted that in order to bring costs in line with SFC expectations the College would have to make further staff cuts of £400k. At the time of our review, the SFC had consented to the Voluntary Scheme submitted by the College, however, this was consent from the SFC to operate the Scheme and not an offer of grant funding. The College are currently waiting on the SFC to confirm if grant funding is available before progressing with the Scheme.

Conflicts of interest are noted and dealt with appropriately by the Board of Management and its Committees. The Board of Management have a register of interest, with interests being declared where appropriate. Please see **Recommendation 2** for further information.

The College makes good use of their Board of Management Committee structure, with all members of the Senior Leadership Team and others contributing to paper creation. This is in line with good practice.

Terms of reference for the Board of Management and its Committees are clear and unambiguous. The schemes of delegation are in line with schedules we have reviewed elsewhere.

Having attended the Board of Management meeting on the 15th December 2020 to observe how the Board of Management operated/functioned, it was clear, despite the virtual nature of the meeting, this Board seem to work well together. **Good Practice Point 1** in Section 3 above underlines this observation.

The Committees of the Board of Management appear to be working well, with the majority of the work being undertaken initially at Committee level; with non-Committee Members having the opportunity to scrutinise matters at the Board of Management. Indeed, at the 15th December 2020 meeting, we saw this in practice where there was good engagement and reasonable and effective challenge being shown by the Board of Management.

The 2019/20 Financial Statements were compliant with OSCR's charity regulations and as far as we can determine (from the information we have seen) the 2020/21 accounts (via the Joint Finance & General Purpose & Audit Committee meeting on the 11th February 2021) will also be compliant. The Statement of Compliance within the Governance Statement of the College's 2020/21 financial statements outlines that the College are compliant with principals of the 2016 Code of Good Governance for Scottish Colleges with the exception of criteria C3: Accountability & Delegation and C22: Financial & Institutional Sustainability. As noted above the Board of Management and the Senior Leadership Team have taken decisive action and a

three-year budget was submitted to the SFC in June 2020 that highlights a balanced budget by the end of 2022/23.

5.1.4 Effectiveness

From the interviews we conducted with both Board of Management and Staff Member's **Annex i)**, the consensus was that the Chair of the Board of Management was very effective.

In their view, the Chair provides the character and leadership expected of the role. The Chair's style is fair, respectful, consultative, inclusive and very much team based. It was also highlighted that the Chair puts in a lot of work for the College that includes their commitments to UHI. Having observed the Chair and their interactions with the Principal, Clerk and others, it was evident to us that they work well with all of those they are tasked with leading. **Good Practice Point 1** outlines how well the Chair conducts the meeting.

While there seems to be a good mix of skills and experience on the Board of Management, the College have not undertaken a formal skills review exercise since 2017. The College are in the early stages of undertaking this, please see **Recommendation 4**.

All Board Members interviewed seemed to have a clear understanding of their roles and responsibilities.

Good Practice Point 2 outlines that the Clerk to the Board is very clear about what their role is, as was the Chair of the Board of Management. From discussions it was clear that although the role is a part-time one, there is always more to do than the time allowed for it specifically during the Covid-19 pandemic. The Clerk noted that during the pandemic and working from home has resulted in them often working more than their 21 hours, however, they noted that this was not a specific issue prior to the pandemic and working from home arrangements.

During our review, the Support Staff Board Member resigned from the Board. The reason given was due to their workload and that they were struggling to keep up with their day job and attendance at meetings. The Clerk highlighted that they asked the Board Member to stay on for a few weeks to allow the College time to recruit a replacement, but the Board Member felt they had to resign with immediate effect. The Clerk noted that while they have a long-term Teaching Board Member, the recruitment and retention of the Support Staff Board Member has proved troublesome and that this was the second resignation citing workload in a short period of time, please see **Recommendation 5**.

5.1.5 Relationships & Collaboration

As **Good Practice Point 3** highlights, from discussions held with Board Members, the Chair and Principal, it appears that the College is well connected locally and regionally.

The College are involved in the Moray Growth Deal, this is a regional deal designed to boost economic growth across Moray. The My Moray website states that “It is a long-term plan centred around specific projects designed to transform the economy, address concerns around encouraging young people to live and work in the area and address gender inequality in employment”. The Moray Growth Deal involves the College working with the Scottish and UK Governments, Moray Council and other partners across the public and third sectors and private businesses.

On the 29th January 2021, the Board of Management held a meeting to review and approve the Business Cases for the 2 projects led by the College as part of the Moray Growth Deal. These being the BE Hub Project and the Moray Aerospace, Advanced Technology, and Innovation Campus (MAATIC) Project.

The BE Hub Project is “designed to promote inclusive economic development in Moray (and the wider region), primarily by supporting scale-up of existing small and micro-businesses, as well as providing support to start-ups, university spin-outs and inward investors”.

The MAATIC Project is described as using “once-in-a-generation combination of the Moray Growth Deal and strategic aerospace developments at the only operational RAF Base in Scotland to provide a genuinely transformational opportunity for the region and its people”. Ultimately the project will help inspire Moray’s children and create much needed jobs and opportunities.

Since the completion of the last Externally Facilitated Board Effectiveness Review, the College have appointed a Head of Academic Partnership and two Depute Heads of Academic Partnership whose role it is to develop relationships with externally facilitated stakeholders including employers, schools, Skills Development Scotland and Highlands and Islands Enterprises.

The College are also represented on the Community Planning Board for Moray and the Developing Young People Board and Operational Group for Moray.

From the conversations we had, the Board of Management and the Principal were very much minded that the College had a central role to play in ensuring the needs of the local, regional, and national communities are met and that the College does so on a basis which is sustainable for them through sharing in the economic benefits all these initiatives accrue.

5.2 Board of Management Self Evaluation

5.2.1 Individual Board of Management Members

The Chair of the Board of Management undertakes self-assessment development meetings with Board Members. For 2020, the completion of the meetings was staggered due to Covid-19 with the meetings beginning in March 2020 and being completed in June 2020.

The Chair also undertakes an annual one to one with the Principal that was undertaken in February 2021. The Chair of the Court at UHI undertakes an annual self-assessment one to one with the Chair of the Board of Management.

The Board are well placed in the process of individual and collective self-evaluation. This is a key strength for the Board, as it shows a willingness of the Board to look at what they do, how they do it and what they can individually and collectively do to ensure there is continual development and evolution in the governance of Moray College UHI.

At the time of our review, the College were preparing the self-assessment programme for 2021.

5.2.2 The Collective Board of Management

As well as individual self-evaluation, collective self-evaluation seems to be a foundation in what the Board of Management do each year. The results of the annual Board of Management self-evaluation are collated and present to the Board of Management by the Clerk who also ensures that any training needs are highlighted and acted upon.

At the time of our review, the College were preparing the evaluation programme for 2021.

5.3 Board of Management Member Participation in Strategic decisions

The Board of Management papers, subsequent minutes and discussions observed during this review indicates that Board Members all appear to participate in decision making at the College. However, our meetings with Board Members indicated that they would like Board papers to be issued timelier to allow them to properly prepare and digest the information, please see **Recommendation 2**.

Section 6 Recommendations, Client Comments & Action Plan

	Finding	Recommendation	Grading	Client Comments	Agreed Actions & Responsibility	Timeline
1.	<p>The Board of Management's published Code of Conduct states that the Code was due for review in August 2020, however, this has yet to take place.</p> <p>We note that the Code of Conduct nationally is under review and the College plan to update their Code of Conduct following this review.</p>	<p>We recommend that the College update the review information within the published Code of Conduct.</p>	Priority 3 - Low	This has now been completed.	Clerk to the Board of Management updated the published Code of Conduct.	Completed
2.	<p>Our review highlighted that Board Members were concerned over timeliness of some Board of Management and Committee papers.</p>	<p>We recommend that the Board Members work with the Clerk and current Chair to specify the types of papers they wish to see and the timelines over which they wish to receive these.</p> <p>We further recommend that those tasked with creating Board and Committee papers, put aside appropriate time in their diaries to ensure that papers are comprehensive, informative and meet the known timetables for the delivery of such papers.</p>	Priority 2 - Medium	<p>We are understanding that during the Covid-19 pandemic, there are additional pressures on members of the SLT and we hope to revert to more timeous papers after some normality returns.</p>	<p>SLT to ensure papers are provided to the Clerk to the Board to ensure the Clerk can circulate the papers timeous.</p>	30 June 2021

	Finding	Recommendation	Grading	Client Comments	Agreed Actions & Responsibility	Timeline
3.	<p>Our review highlighted that there were some frustrations from both the Board Members and the Student Members regarding their role and participation.</p> <p>The Board of Management received an information request from HISA that was discussed at the 15th December 2020 Board of Management meeting. It was evident that this request caused some frustration amongst Board Members. The Student Members of the Board of Management noted that this request was from HISA covering all Colleges within UHI and not specifically from them.</p> <p>It was also evident from our attendance at the Board of Management meeting and discussions with Board Members including Student Members that there was not a full understanding of their roles and responsibilities. This also included the Student Members role as a Board Member. During our meetings with the Student Members, it was highlighted that they believed that it would be worthwhile for incoming Student Members to receive detailed information on what has been happening at the</p>	<p>We recommend that the College work with HISA, UHI and the Student Members of the Board to improve:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Communication between all parties; ➤ Develop a clear document outlining the Student Members roles and responsibility as a Board Member and ➤ Develop a specific induction and training programme for the role the Student Member. <p>The College has also considered a implementing a mentor programme for the Student Members that could be investigated further to help support the Student Members.</p> <p>Furthermore, we recommend that steps are taken to support the Student Members who are retiring to put in place steps to ensure a smooth transition.</p>	<p>Priority 2 - Medium</p>	<p>Moray College will open discussions with UHI and HISA to try and agree a process to enabled Student Members to become more prepared for Board membership.</p>	<p>The Chair of the Board and the Clerk to the Board will contact HISA and UHI as soon as possible.</p> <p>The College will reissue the Board induction pack to Student Members with a cover sheet identifying key elements of their role.</p> <p>The Clerk will also speak with the Student Members to ensure a smooth transition to new members.</p>	<p>30 September 2021</p>

	<p>College and information on any long-term actions discussed at Board of Management meetings to ensure that they have some background information. Both Student Members believed that a strong induction process would be beneficial.</p> <p>Our review also highlighted that Student Members are due to retire at the end of the Academic Year and will be replaced.</p>					
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

	Finding	Recommendation	Grading	Client Comments	Agreed Actions & Responsibility	Timeline
4.	<p>The College has not undertaken a formal review of the skills mix of Board Members since 2017. We do acknowledge that the skills of members have been discussed and potential gaps highlighted.</p> <p>We also note that the College are in the early stages of undertaking a formal skills assessment of Board Members. It is good practice to ensure that a formal skills mix assessment is undertaken on a regular basis e.g. bi-annually.</p>	<p>We recommend that the College ensure that the Board of Management skills assessment is completed, and any gaps are considered. We also recommend that this assessment is then carried out at least bi-annually.</p>	Priority 2 – Medium	<p>We are in the process of undertaking a skills assessment.</p>	<p>Skills assessment is being completed by the Board with support from the Clerk.</p>	30 June 2021
5.	<p>During our review the Support Staff Board Member tendered their resignation from the Board with immediate effect citing workload and that they were struggling to keep up with their day job and attendance at Board of Management meetings.</p> <p>The Clerk also highlighted that this was the second resignation received in a short space of time for this role citing this reason.</p>	<p>We recommend that the College further investigate the reasons that there have been resignations from this role citing workload.</p> <p>We also recommend that the College consider implementing further support to the replacement Support Staff Member once a new Staff Member has been appointed.</p>	Priority 2 – Medium	<p>The Clerk to the Board has received 3 nominations for the role and will hold an election for the post.</p> <p>The Board recognise this as an area for improvement and have laboured the responsibilities to the new applicants while the Clerk has also spoken with the nominations to provide them with more information on the role.</p> <p>The Board has also considered reducing the roles required Committee membership.</p>	<p>Clerk to the Board will ensure that nominations for the post are held.</p> <p>The Clerk to the Board will also work with the new appointment to ensure they receive a full induction and support from the CDN training network.</p>	31 May 2021

Section 7 Annexe's

Annex i)

Board of Management Interviewee List

Interviewee & Role	Method	Location
Peter Graham – Chair of the Board of Management	1-2-1	MS Teams
Catherine Fair – Clerk to the Board of Management	1-2-1	MS Teams
David Patterson – Principal	1-2-1	MS Teams
Jessie McLeman – Chair of the Audit Committee	Group 1	MS Teams
Murray Easton – Chair of the Finance & General Purposes Committee	Group 1	MS Teams
Seonaid Mustard – Chair of the Staff Governance Committee	Group 1	MS Teams
Anne Campbell – Chair of the Learning, Teaching & Quality Committee	Group 1	MS Teams
Rosemary McCormack – Staff Board Member	Group 2	MS Teams
Kyle Gee – Student Board Member	Group 2	MS Teams
Hermione Morris – Student Board Member	Group 2	MS Teams

Annex ii)

Board of Management Agenda – 15th December 2020

BOARD OF MANAGEMENT
Wednesday 15th December 2020
Via Microsoft Teams

Agenda Number	Item	Presented By	Action Required: Decision, Discussion, For Noting
BM.20.07.01	(i) Resignations	C Fair	Noting
	(ii) Appointments		
BM.20.07.02	Apologies for Absence	C Fair	Noting
BM.20.07.03	Any Additional Declarations of Interest including specific items on this Agenda.	Chair	Noting
BM.20.07.04	Minutes of previous Board meetings:	Chair	Decision
	(i) Draft Minutes of Board Meeting held on 27 October 2020 *		
	(ii) Draft Minutes of Special Board meeting held on 5 November 2020		
BM.20.07.05	Matters Arising from previous Board meetings:	Clerk	Noting
	(i) Matters Arising from Board Meeting held on 27 October		
BM.20.07.06	Principal's Report - RESERVED *includes		
	(i) Overview *	D Patterson	Discussion
	(ii) Student Recruitment and Enrolment update	C Newlands	Noting
	(iii) KPI's		
	(iv) Moray Growth Deal - verbal update	D Patterson	Noting
	(v) Update on Health and Safety - incident report	D Patterson D Duncan	
BM.20.07.07	Draft Minutes of Regional Strategic Committee 5 November 2020 *		Noting
BM.20.07.08	Draft Minutes of UHI Court 25 November 2020 *		Noting

BM.20.07.09	Minutes of Committee Meetings		
	(i) Remuneration Committee 5-11-2020 *	M Easton	Noting
	(ii) Draft Minutes from Staff Governance Committee on 10-11-	S Mustard	Noting
	(iii) Draft Minutes from Learning, Teaching and Quality Committee 10-11-2020 *	A Campbell	Noting
	(iv) Draft Minutes from Finance and General Purposes on 24-11-2020	M Easton	Noting
	(v) Audit Committee on 24-11-2020	J McLeman	Noting
BM.20.07.10	Learning and Teaching	N Yoxall	Noting
	(i) Overview		
	(ii) EREP Final Report *		
	(iii) Student Early Experience Survey		
BM.20.07.11	Curriculum - verbal update	C Newlands	Noting
BM.20.07.12	Staffing reductions - consultation process verbal update -RESERVED	C Thomson/SLT	Discussion
BM.20.07.13	Finance Update	M Easton	Noting
	(i) Q1 Management Accounts *		
	(ii) F&GP - Annual Report to the Board		
BM.20.07.14	Emerging Issues	Chair	Discussion
	(i) Update on UHI	Chair	Noting/discussio
	(ii) Position on UHI Shared Finance Options	D Patterson	Noting
	(iii) E-mail security	D Duncan	Noting/discussio
BM.20.07.15	Externally Facilitated Board Effectiveness Review *	Wylie & Bisset	Noting
BM.20.07.16	HISA Update	HISA	Noting
	(i) HISA Letter to the Board *	HISA	
	(ii) Response to HISA Letter	Board	Discussion
BM.20.07.17	Annual Health and Safety Report	D Duncan	Noting
	(i) Annual sign off of Health and Safety Policy Statement (Annually)		

	(ii) Health and Safety Questionnaire		
BM.20.07.18	Date of next meeting - 28-1-2021	Clerk	Noting
RESERVED ITEMS			
BM.20.07.19	Reserved Minutes of Previous Board Meetings.	Chair	
	(i) Reserved Draft Minutes of Board		Decision
	(ii) Reserved Draft Minutes from Special Board Meeting on 5 November 2020 *		
BM.20.07.20	Reserved Matters Arising/Actions from previous Board meetings:	Clerk	Noting
	(i) Reserved Matters Arising/Actions from Board Meeting 27 October		
	(ii) Reserved Matters Arising/Actions from Special Board Meeting on		
BM.20.07.21	Reserved Minutes from Committee		
	(i) Reserved Draft Minutes from Remuneration Committee on 5-11-	M Easton	Noting
	(ii) Reserved Draft Minutes from Staff Governance Committee on 10-	S Mustard	Noting
	(iii) Reserved Draft Minutes from Learning, Teaching and Quality Committee on 10-11-2020*	A Campbell	Noting
	(iv) Reserved Draft Minutes from Finance and General Purposes on	M Easton	Noting
	(v) Reserved Draft Minutes from Audit	J McLeman	Noting

Assurance Levels

Strong	Controls satisfactory, no major weaknesses found, no or only minor recommendations identified.
Substantial	Controls largely satisfactory although some weaknesses identified, recommendations for improvement made.
Weak	Controls unsatisfactory and major systems weaknesses identified that require to be addressed immediately.
No	No or very limited controls in place leaving the system open to significant error or abuse, recommendations made require to be implemented immediately.

Recommendation Priorities

Priority	Classification
1 (High)	Weakness that we consider needs to be brought to the attention of the Board and addressed by the College.
2 (Medium)	Significant issue or weakness/improvement which should be addressed by the Organisation as soon as possible.
3 (Low)	Minor issue or weakness/improvement reported where the Organisation may wish to consider our recommendation.